

# Recommendation Report

Tuesday, March 25, 2008

**Log Number** M-0439  
**Issue Date** 3/18/2005

**Staten Island NY**

**10/15/2003**

About 1520 on October 15, 2003, the Staten Island Ferry Andrew J. Barberi, owned and operated by the New York City Department of Transportation, was at the end of a regularly scheduled trip from Manhattan to Staten Island when it allided at full speed with a maintenance pier at the St. George ferry terminal. Fifteen crewmembers and an estimated 1,500 passengers were on board. The assistant captain was at the controls but, for reasons that could not be determined, was unresponsive to cues of the impending allision. Except for one deckhand, the crewmembers also did not recognize that the ferry was in danger. Ten passengers died in the accident and 70 were injured. An eleventh passenger died 2 months later as a result of injuries sustained in the accident. Damages totaled more than \$8 million, including repair costs of \$6.9 million for the Andrew J. Barberi and \$1.4 million for the pier.

**Recommendation #** M-05-004

**Overall Status**  
OAA

**Priority**

The National Transportation Safety Board makes the following safety recommendations to the U.S. Coast Guard: Revise regulation 46 CFR 10.709 to require that the results of all physical examinations be reported to the Coast Guard, and provide guidance to mariners, employers, and mariner medical examiners on the specific actions required to comply with these regulations.

USCG

Open - Acceptable Response

5/18/2005 Addressee Letter Mail Controlled 5/24/2005 8:03:10 AM MC# 2050216 We concur with this recommendation. We agree that there is a need to ensure that we are made aware of the results of all physical examinations, especially when they may identify medical conditions affecting licensed mariners' abilities to safely perform their duties on vessels. We will begin by conducting an analysis to determine the responsibilities and resources required to effectively implement such a requirement. We anticipate providing guidance on any new medical review requirements to mariners, employers, and mariner medical examiners through a Navigation and Vessel Inspection Circular (NVIC) to be drafted once our analysis is complete and an implementation plan has been established. We will keep the Board informed of our progress on this recommendation.

8/24/2005 NTSB Although the Coast Guard did not specifically commit to revising 46 CFR 10.709 as requested, the Safety Board is pleased that the Coast Guard concurs with the recommendation and that there is a need for it to be aware of the results of physical exams, especially when medical conditions exist. The Board notes that the Coast Guard will (1) conduct an analysis to determine the responsibilities and resources required to effectively implement the recommendation and (2) provide guidance on any new medical review requirements to mariners, employers, and mariner medical examiners through a Navigation and Vessel Inspection Circular. Because the Coast Guard has initiated action on this issue, Safety Recommendation M-05-04 is classified "Open--Acceptable Response." The Safety Board would appreciate periodic updates on the status of these initiatives, including regulatory actions to require that the results of all physical examinations be reported to the Coast

# Recommendation Report

Tuesday, March 25, 2008

**Recommendation # M-05-005**

**Overall Status  
OAA**

**Priority**

The National Transportation Safety Board makes the following safety recommendations to the U.S. Coast Guard: In formal consultation with experts in the field of occupational medicine, review your medical oversight process and take actions to address, at a minimum, the lack of tracking of performed examinations; the potential for inconsistent interpretations and evaluations between medical practitioners; deficiencies in the system of storing medical data; the absence of requirements for mariners or others to report changes in medical condition between examinations; and the limited ability of the Coast Guard to review medical evaluations made by personal health care providers.

USCG

Open - Acceptable Response

5/18/2005 Addressee Letter Mail Controlled 5/24/2005 8:03:10 AM MC# 2050216 We concur with this recommendation. We have been reviewing our medical oversight process, focusing on those areas identified by the Board. As a result, we have already determined to take the following actions: add to the Merchant Manner Licensing and Documentation (MMLD) database the ability to track physical waivers granted by the Coast Guard and the conditions for which they are granted; add to the MMLD database the ability to store the medical history of mariners in a centralized location versus the current hard copy file system; update guidelines for physical examination procedures and conditions which may require a waiver to provide better standards; propose regulations to require mariners to report any change in their medical condition between examinations which would result in the mariner not meeting Coast Guard physical standards, or when a mariner is placed on a new prescription drug; and create a full time position at the National Maritime Center for a physician or other medical specialist in the field of occupational medicine to review medical waiver requests and mariner physicals. We will keep the Board informed of our progress on this recommendation.

8/24/2005 NTSB The Safety Board is pleased that the Coast Guard is taking action to address these issues, including the employment of a database to track mariner physical exams, and will hire a physician or other medical specialist in the field of occupational medicine to review medical waiver requests and mariner physicals. Accordingly, Safety Recommendation M-05-05 is classified "Open--Acceptable Response," pending completion of this effort.

**Total Number of Recommendations for Recommendation Report: 2**

**Selection for Report:**